

MINUTES
(Audio Recording Available)
**BOARD OF BUILDING STANDARDS/
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW/SIGN REVIEW BOARD**
MEETING OF April 12, 2012
5:30 PM - LAKEWOOD CITY HALL
AUDITORIUM

A. The Chairman called the meeting to order at 5:30 P.M.

1. **ROLL CALL**

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Michael Fleenor
Michael Molinski, Chair
Carl Orban, Vice-Chair
John Waddell

OTHERS PRESENT:

Dru Siley, Secretary, Dir. of P&D
Jeff Fillar, Asst. Bldg. Comm., Residential
Dave Kulscar, Div. of Bldg., Commercial
Bryce Sylvester, Planner

A motion was made by Mr. Molinski, seconded by Mr. Fleenor, to EXCUSE Cynthia Stockman from the meeting. All of the members voting yea, the motion passed.

2. Approve the minutes of the March 8, 2012 meeting

A motion was made by Mr. Waddell, seconded by Mr. Orban, to **APPROVE** the minutes of the March 8, 2012 meeting. All of the members voting yea, the motion passed.

3. Opening remarks.

Mr. Molinski waived the reading of the Opening Remarks.

SUMMARY APPROVED

SIGN REVIEW

14. **Docket 04-30-12**

13411 Detroit Avenue
Danny's Deli

- () Approve
() Deny
() Defer

Michael Bizjak
Sign-Lite
12655 Coit Road
Cleveland, Ohio 44108

The applicants request the review and approval of a new panel for an existing wall sign cabinet. (Page 83)

16. **Docket 04-32-12**

16300 Delaware Avenue
DASO Financial Planning/AXA Advisors

- () Approve
() Deny
() Defer

Michael J. Daso
DASO Financial Planning/AXA Advisors
16300 Delaware Avenue
Lakewood, Ohio 44107

The applicant requests the review and approval of the change of a sign panel on the ground sign for AXA Advisors. (Page 100)

17. **Docket 04-33-12**

**16803 Detroit Avenue
Dairy Queen**

- ☐ Approve
- ☐ Deny
- ☐ Defer

Michael DiMichele
Erie Design
1605 Marlowe Avenue
Lakewood, Ohio 44107

The applicant requests the review and approval for panel replacements in an existing pole sign. (Page 102)

20. **Docket 04-36-12**

**1215 West Clifton Boulevard
Horace Mann Elementary School**

- ☐ Approve
- ☐ Deny
- ☐ Defer

John Walsh and John Brich
Brilliant Electric Sign
4811 Van Epps Road
Cleveland, Ohio 44131

The applicant requests the review and approval of a digital message board at Horace Mann School. (Page 120)

A motion was made by Mr. Waddell, seconded by Mr. Fleenor, to **APPROVE** the SUMMARY APPROVED. All of the members voting yea, the motion passed.

OLD BUSINESS

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW

4. **Docket 02-15-12**

R

1270 Beach Avenue

- ☐ Approve
- ☐ Deny
- ☐ Defer

Mohammed Amawi
1270 Beach Avenue
Lakewood, Ohio 44107

The applicant requests the review and approval for the enclosing of a front porch. This item was deferred from the meeting of March 8, 2012. (Page 5a)

Mohammed Amawi, owner and applicant, was present to explain the request. He said he would match the side windows with the front windows of the porch and replace the double door with a single door. He asked the Board to allow him until October to complete the project.

Mr. Orban inquired about the space(s) to the side of the door. Mr. Amawi said he would like to work with the City and submit drawings at the time of obtaining the permit from the Division of Building. Mr. Fillar asked if the drawing could be submitted for a minor change. Mr. Molinski replied to the affirmative.

Mr. Fleenor suggested the addition of another window along with the installation of the single door to allow for transparency; not to use additional siding to fill the space.

There were no comments or questions from the public or city staff.

A motion was made by Mr. Molinski, seconded by Mr. Waddell, to **APPROVE** with the following stipulations:

1. Side windows were to match the front windows,
2. The double door was to be replaced with a single door, and
3. Drawings to be submitted to the Board for minor change within thirty (30) days.

All of the members voting yea, the motion passed.

5. Docket 03-22-12

R 1354 Manor Park Avenue

- ☐ Approve
- ☐ Deny
- ☐ Defer

Andrew Schmidt
Joyce Factory Direct
1125 Berea Industrial Parkway
Berea, Ohio 44017

The applicant requests the review and approval of a front porch enclosure. This item was deferred from the meeting of March 8, 2012. (Page 6)

Andrew Schmidt, applicant, was present to explain the request. He referred to the submitted revisions that reflected the vertical hung windows and siding below the windows to match the existing; white vinyl siding would be used due to the difficulty of matching aluminum. The walls under the roof would be replaced. Everything would be up to code.

Mr. Molinski asked about the corners. Mr. Schmidt replied they would be structural posts to the roof and white in color. The door would be white also.

There were no further comments from the Board. There were no comments or questions from the public or city staff.

A motion was made by Mr. Molinski, seconded by Mr. Waddell to **APPROVE** the application as revised. All of the members voting yea, the motion passed.

SIGN REVIEW

6. Docket 03-23-12

17103 Detroit Avenue
Geppetto's Pizza & Ribs

- ☐ Approve
- ☐ Deny
- ☐ Defer

Brett Smith
Direct Image Signs Inc.
7820 Maddock Road
North Ridgeville, Ohio 44039

The applicant requests the review and approval of an electronic display ground sign. This item was deferred from the meeting of March 8, 2012. (Page 10)

Brett Smith, applicant, and Mike O'Malley, business owner, were present to explain the request. The design had been revised to have a permanent top section, larger than the message section underneath. The sign would be two panels. The top portion would be internally florescent illuminated and about two feet wide. The existing metal posts and the stone surround base would remain. The size of the sign would be less than forty (40) square feet.

townhome that had fallen into disrepair and was the location of criminal activity. The city acquired the property and the Land Bank demolished it. Partnered with the applicant, the city anticipated the project to benefit the neighborhood and provide a great single family home on the site on a large yard.

Mr. Fleenor and Mr. Orban agreed with Mr. Neumann's suggestion for a hip roof on the return. Mr. Kear said there might not be enough room for one on the back.

A motion was made by Mr. Molinski, seconded by Mr. Orban to **APPROVE** with the following stipulations:

1. There was to be a hip roof on the front porch return south elevation,
2. There would be a possible small hip roof at the back entrance, and
3. To provide an elevation displaying a bay kitchen window.

All of the members voting yea, the motion passed.

ADD-ON

BOARD OF BUILDING STANDARDS

22. Docket 04-39-12 - B

15312 Detroit Avenue
Quaker Steak & Lube

- ☐ Approve
- ☐ Deny
- ☐ Defer

Benjamin Hoffman
Advance Sign Group
5150 Walcutt Court
Columbus, Ohio 43228

The applicant requests the review and approval of four variances: 1) to allow more than one business sign, 2) signage in excess of permitted area, 3) more than four colors, and 4) more than one information sign, pursuant to Sections 1329.12(d), 1329.11 Schedule B, 1329.09(d)(5), 1329.09(c)(12), 1329.05(m), 1329.05(b), 1329.05(c)(7), and 1329.09(c)(1). (Page 134)

SIGN REVIEW

23. Docket 04-39-12 - S

15312 Detroit Avenue
Quaker Steak & Lube

- ☐ Approve
- ☐ Deny
- ☐ Defer

Benjamin Hoffman
Advance Sign Group
5150 Walcutt Court
Columbus, Ohio 43228

The applicants request the review and approval of new signage. (Page 134)

Nancy Wasserstrom, Advance Sign Group, was present to explain the request. Based upon the pre-review meeting of April 5th, she provided revisions to the proposed. On the front and rear elevations, the Quaker Steak & Lube channel letters were lowered to below the roof height, eliminated the border neon that followed the roof line, and reduced the lettering size of the words on the front of the canopy. For the graphic on the east elevation, they would use a vintage photograph of Lakewood's Detroit Avenue. Mr. Molinski said the Board had requested the Eat arrow sign be turned flat to the wall. She said Quaker Steak & Lube conceded with a flat sign on the front elevation but wanted a blade sign on the rear elevation. The border neon was typical to the look of her clients' other buildings where a less intense LED neon had been used. The rear awning had an approximate projection of about four feet (4'). The front elevation was for a patio projection of eleven feet (11'). When asked about ambient lighting under the front canopy, she said her company was not involved in that aspect of the project.

Mr. Waddell felt the Eat arrow sign on the north elevation should be flat, and the one on the south elevation should be a blade design. When asked about the border LED lighting, she described it as being less intense, long lived, maintenance free, and more expensive to purchase. Mr. Fleenor and Mr. Orban said there was no use for the neon border. Mr. Orban and Mr. Molinski said it was in close proximity to a residential and its use was not warranted. Ms. Wasserstrom said Quaker Steak & Lube were most anxious to get started and would be open to the Eat signs.

Mr. Siley thanked the application for the revisions and noted a blade sign made sense in the rear because of visibility. He felt the large awning on the north elevation and the east elevation graphic were enough to allow for a flat Eat sign in front. Mr. Orban said the north elevation had changed with Drug Mart recently building a docking station on the rear.

There were no comments or questions from the public. Mr. Siley stated the east elevation graphic had been modified to be a plastic composite adhered to the surface of the brick allowing the texture of the brick to be seen giving the appearance of a painted mural. Mr. Fleenor described both images: one was a streetcar used on Detroit Avenue as Lakewood was a streetcar suburb, and the second one was of City Hall Council in 1921 (was actually the Chamber of Commerce in 1921) and felt either one of them would be appropriate.

A motion was made by Mr. Molinski, seconded Mr. Fleenor, to **APPROVE Dockets 04-39-12 B and 04-39-12 – S with the following stipulations:**

1. There is a final decision for the mural graphic, and
2. The neon lettering size is reduced as revised.

All of the members voting yea, the motion passed.

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW

8.	Docket 04-25-12	C	18501 Detroit Avenue FOLICLE (a salon)
	() Approve		Liz Vega
	() Deny		FOLICLE (a salon)
	() Defer		18501 Detroit Avenue Lakewood, Ohio 44107

The applicant requests the review and approval of exterior alterations. (Page 19)

Liz Vega, applicant, was present to explain the request. She wanted to replace the decorative fence at the front window with one similar in style. The current one was old and beaten. The replacement one would be aluminum with a stainless steel finish look in lieu of a wrought iron look.

There were no comments or questions from the public or city staff.

A motion was made by Mr. Molinski, seconded by Mr. Waddell, to **APPROVE** the application as submitted. All of the members voting yea, the motion passed.

Item 21 called with Item 10 as it is the same property.

10.	Docket 04-27-12	C	11832 Madison Avenue Madison Avenue Car Wash
	() Approve		Mark W. Ruby, Architect
	() Deny		199 North Leavitt Road, Suite 201
	() Defer		Amherst, Ohio 44001

The applicants request the review and approval of exterior alterations. (Page 31)

SIGN REVIEW

21. **Docket 04-37-12**

**11832 Madison Avenue
Madison Avenue Car Wash**

- ☐ Approve
- ☐ Deny
- ☐ Defer

Mark W. Ruby, Architect
199 North Leavitt Road, Suite 201
Amherst, Ohio 44001

The applicants request the review and approval of a new wall sign. (Page 122)

Dave Hoffman, property owner, and Mark W. Ruby, applicant, were present to explain the request. Mr. Hoffman provided photographs of other facilities he owned that were finished identically to the proposed. All four sides of the existing building would be re-clad with batten vinyl and faux shake in the modified roof line of the peak. The steel roof would be newly vinyl coated. Two new windows would be added in the lunch room and one in the office for light and air. Awnings would added over three windows to add color to the exterior and to block the sun, and one in the rear entrance because of visibility issues caused from sun glare. The awnings would be read vinyl, and the gooseneck lights would be black. The sign in the gable would be flat, black, plastic cutout letters on a white azik background. The side signage would be the same style and color. Mr. Molinski felt it was a nice improvement.

There were no comments or questions from the public or city staff. Mr. Siley thanked the owner for the renovations as it was an improvement to the neighborhood.

A motion was made by Mr. Molinski, seconded by Mr. Orban, to **APPROVE Dockets 04-27-12 and 04-37-12** as submitted. All of the members voting yea, the motion passed.

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW

11. **Docket 04-28-12**

**C 13200 Madison Avenue
Mahall's 20 Lanes**

- ☐ Approve
- ☐ Deny
- ☐ Defer

Kelly Flamos and Joseph Pavlick
FP Mahall's LLC
13200 Madison Avenue
Lakewood, Ohio 44107

The applicant requests the review and approval of the proposed installation of overhead doors. (Page 36)

Joe Pavlick and Kelly Flamos, owners and applicants, were present to explain the request. They wanted two glass and aluminum garage doors on the southwest annex of the building facing Madison Avenue, and to install one exterior door encased in aluminum on the east side of the property for entrance to and exit from the restaurant area. He continued the other planned exterior work would be for maintenance purposes such as tuck pointing of the brick, and extensive interior work had been done with more to follow. No further exterior changes were anticipated. Ms. Flamos said they could paint the existing wood exterior of a former storefront. Mr. Pavlick said the front awning would remain although they would like to make a change in the future but not now. The exterior bowling pin blade sign was refurbished.

Mr. Siley stated that Mahall's had been in Lakewood for a long time. He had seen the revamping of the interior and noted that the building itself was disjointed because of expansion and past renovations. He continued the current interior renovations were superior and expected no less for the exterior.

Linda Lee, 1659 Clarence Avenue, spoke in support of the new owners and the rehabbing but was concerned about noise and overflow of patrons from the bar. She asked if there were to be tables outside the open garage doors. Mr. Pavlick replied there were no plans for tables, but there would be a gate to prevent patrons from going on the sidewalk. Their plans included a patio in the future. Ms. Lee wanted management to maintain a debris-free and quiet environment. Mr. Siley said any permit issued for a patio would be based upon a Conditional Use granted by the Planning Commission and was granted yearly based upon positive reports. Mr. Pavlick said they were sensitive to the community and wanted to promote it as being classy.

Judy Gabowski, 1265 Beach Avenue, spoke in support of the project. She worked as the branch manager of the Madison Branch of the Lakewood Library. She was pleased with the new owners, felt safer with another business in the area, and said the interior work was beautiful in addition to their great food.

Ginny Barrett, 1655 Clarence Avenue, was opposition to the project. Two early mornings of each week, the garbage trucks awaken her; one at the apartments and the other at Mahall's. Each weekend, she cleans debris from her tree lawn; smoking cigarette butts, beer bottles, etc. Parking on her street is difficult. Her next door neighbor operates a saw in the garage. She said there had been problems with people at the apartments. She felt there were not enough staff members to police the place.

Mr. Pavlick spoke in response. He said there were be a gate dividing the sidewalk from the open overhead doors, and if patrons climbed over it, they felt confident they could manage it. They moved the dumpster from the east side of the building to the north side as per the Division of Building's request. They had contacted the refuse company already to change the time of pick-up in response to complaints. Ms. Flamos said it was not just a bar as they were targeting a wide demography of patron such as families.

Danielle McFarlin, 1660 Clarence Avenue, asked about the purpose of the room with the doors. Ms. Flamos explained that the room with the proposed overhead doors was a band room, an area to eat the food, and had pool tables; a mixed use space. Ms. McFarlin sought clarification about the door on the east side of the building. Mr. Pavlick said it would face Madison Avenue, not Clarence Avenue. Ms. Flamos continued they were starting a recycle program which should help in the debris problem.

There were no comments or question from city staff.

Mr. Molinski suggested using clear glass in lieu of tinted and encouraged using canopies in the future. Mr. Orban said the windows, canopies and removal of the wood in the future would offer a look of cohesiveness. Mr. Fleenor liked restoration to a look of transparency.

A motion was made by Mr. Molinski, seconded by Mr. Fleenor, to **APPROVE with the stipulation that clear glass is to be used in the overhead garage doors and on the façade being replaced.** All of the members voting yea, the motion passed.

SIGN REVIEW

15. **Docket 04-31-12**

**1324 Hird Avenue
CubeSmart, L.P.**

- ☐ Approve
- ☐ Deny
- ☐ Defer

Randi Good
Sign Vision Co.
987 Claycraft Road

The applicant requests the review and approval of the replacement of existing business signs. (Page 89)

Don Castle, Sign Vision Co., was present to explain the request. A new ownership required a name change with channel letters and cabinet on the former four signs. The elevation of West 117th street showed a change of the sign location and had an increase in size.

There were no comments or questions from the public. Mr. Siley stated if there was just a change of name and no change in size, it would not be a problem.

A motion was made by Mr. Molinski, seconded by Mr. Fleenor, to **APPROVE with the stipulation the height of the sign lettering be the same size as the existing.** All of the members voting yea, the motion passed.

18. **Docket 04-34-12**

**17113 Madison Avenue
Scaravilli Design & Studio Gallery**

- ☐ Approve
- ☐ Deny
- ☐ Defer

Charles Scaravilli
Scaravilli Design
17113 Madison Avenue
Lakewood, Ohio 44107

The applicant requests the review and approval of a ground sign. (Page 106)

Charles Scaravilli, owner and applicant, was present to explain the request. The sign would be on a wrought iron bracket and mounted to a wooden 4x4 beam cemented two feet deep into the ground about five feet from the sidewalk and centered in the width of the yard. There would be vinyl lettering on a plastic composite face. The post would be painted. He had no plans for lighting. Mr. Fleenor said there was a lot of information on it, and wondered if it could be simplified. Mr. Scaravilli said the design had been used for years in Little Italy; possibly he could remove the web address.

There were no comments from the public or city staff.

A motion was made by Mr. Molinski, seconded by Mr. Waddell, to **APPROVE** the application as submitted. All of the members voting yea, the motion passed.

19. **Docket 04-35-12**

**11716 Detroit Avenue
Virginia Marti College**

- ☐ Approve
- ☐ Deny
- ☐ Defer

Lou Belknap
Agile Sign & Lighting
35280 Lakeland Boulevard
Eastlake, Ohio 44095

The applicant requests the review and approval of a new ground sign for Virginia Marti Design Studio. (Page 108)

Lou Belknap, applicant, was present to explain the request. They planned to utilize the existing block base. The top half of the sign would be routed aluminum, the plastic would have black vinyl so the edges would light to

provide a halo illumination, the side posts would be fabricated aluminum, and the electronic message center would have four rows of five inch copy with red mono color lettering.

There were no comments or questions from the public. Mr. Siley stated the same conditions applied there were to be no animated graphics and the reader board was limited to one color.

A motion was made by Mr. Molinski, seconded by Mr. Orban, to **APPROVE with the following stipulations:**

1. **The reader board was to be a singular color, and**
2. **Animated graphics were prohibited.**

All of the members voting yea, the motion passed.

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW

12. **Docket 04-29-12**

C

**14013 Detroit Avenue
GetGo**

☐ Approve

☐ Deny

☐ Defer

Giant Eagle, Inc.

Attn: Pat Avolio

261 Kappa Drive

Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15238

The applicant requests the review and approval of the construction of a new gas fueling facility. (Page 45)

Pat Avolio, Director of Development for Giant Eagle, was present to explain the request. Accompanying him were Dina Snider, Strada Architects and Carmine Russo, Jr., Cawrse and Associates, Inc., a landscape architect. Mr. Avolio described the property in its present condition. The property being purchased for redevelopment was outlined in red. The two existing residential homes were not incorporated into the development, but the blue line indicated what was being incorporated. The property was zoned C3, Commercial and General Business, and a gas station was permitted. Under Section 1129.09 of the city's zoning code, there were additional supplemental regulations under gas stations. The proposed station complied with all specific provisions and was consistent with the spirit and intent of the requirements of the zoning code. The proposed building was approximately 5,600 square feet with approximately 20 seats in the convenience store and 20 seats in the exterior seating area. The exterior seating area will require a permitted Conditional Use from the Planning Commission. The existing pavers and neglected trees along Detroit Avenue would be removed and replaced with wider sidewalks and bus shelter. There would be a canopied gasoline dispenser area with eight islands. There would be additional landscaping. The existing paving line ran along the red line. Some paving would be removed, and there would be added lawn area, additional evergreen species and trees by the adjoining residential unit adding a brick pier and additional hedges and landscaping at the outside perimeter of the development. The existing vegetation and tree will be removed and extend the sidewalk for pedestrian amenity. The entrance drives would have a right turn in and right turn out to Detroit Avenue, one entrance off Parkhaven Row shifted toward Detroit Avenue from the existing, and one on Bunts Road in its same location approximately. He then described to locations of the parking areas, service station area, and a convenience store. The two immediate residential homes south of the project would be purchased by the corporation and sold and/or leased. He continued state regulations required an emergency stop 100 feet radius from the gasoline dispensing island, and this project would have two emergency stops. He spoke of the setbacks as per the revised building line map. They proposed to use brick pier fencing along the perimeter of the property with shrubbery, a corner element, and an historical plaque. The sidewalk would be along the entire front. The canopy structure would be non-illuminated with a brick base on the bottom, steel columns, and dispensing island. They proposed an eight-foot high TREX board fence, the retaining wall would remain with the existing vegetation, and replace the four foot high chain link fence with six foot high TREX board fence. He said they could use wood for the fence, but that had a tendency to deteriorate and need repair. He indicated where the underground storage tanks would be

along with the truck routing for deliveries; enter at Bunts Road and exit onto Detroit Avenue. He showed the location of the outdoor seating and the bio-retention rain area along Parkhaven Row. They met the requirements for storm water reduction by reducing the area of impervious materials. A variance request was for setback as it exceeded the building line map. Another variance request was for how the structure was interpreted as it might be construed as a building. Mr. Avolio then described the floor plan of the convenience store.

Ms. Snider described the elevations. The elevation facing the fuel canopy exhibited masonry, cast stone base, awnings, and an anodized aluminum store system; all features were on the four sides. On the Detroit Avenue, a pattern was created using brick. The cornice element was made from aluminum. The fuel canopy had rounded corners, the brick piers were the same materials as the store, the trash enclosure was masonry with a capstone cap, and TREX material would be used for the enclosure gates.

Mr. Russo explained the landscaping and the solution to the storm water problem. They were adding green area after removing hard surfaces. Plantings would be planted in soil about three feet deep with lots of surface for infiltration. Concern with adjacent properties was prompting the retaining of the evergreen hedge. Additional evergreen trees (Colorado Spruce) would be planted. Plantings of trees behind the fence would be along Bunts Road and Detroit Avenue. Deciduous and evergreen shrubbery would be in between the street trees. They would attempt to screen some of the utilities from the street with greenery. Foundation plantings would be around the sign. Cleveland Select Pear trees were the proposed species.

Mr. Avolio said the storage tanks were double walled (a tank within a tank), they would be continuously and automatically monitored, there would be underground sumps for each dispenser, vapors would be drawn into a unit when product was dispensed, a permeator to prevent vapors from evaporating, the canopy would provide venting, double lines and conduit lines. They would be sensitive to the hours for deliveries to avoid rush hours and busy hours at the store such as Saturday afternoons. They conducted a traffic study following the Institute of Transportation and Engineering Standards requirements, and there would be a reduction in the amount of traffic based on the former use of a grocery store. He again listed the planned materials, grey bollards with white reflective tape, spackled silver was for the seating area, and et cetera (drawings were available).

Mr. Molinski wanted to know which windows would be spandrel glazed. Mr. Orban wanted to know the height of and the number of lights on the site. Mr. Molinski wanted to know if the canopy could be lower than sixteen feet. Mr. Avolio replied that they might be able to reduce the canopy height by six inches at a maximum as they had to allow for clearance of tall vehicles. Mr. Molinski about the planting beds at the edge of the sidewalk and inquired if a small wall or edging material could be added to contain the mulch. Mr. Fleenor thanked them for the project as they took the City's and Historical Society's concerns into consideration. He continued the historical plaque should be mounted on a pole, not a fence. Mr. Orban concurred with Mr. Fleenor. Mr. Siley asked about the corner and bus shelter. Mr. Avolio explained they were adding more concrete area to the sidewalk that would overflow to the bus shelter.

Dennis Pehotsky, 1430 Parkhaven Row, said the delivery trucks used to sit idle in the west parking lot when the former Giant Eagle occupied the store, subjecting his family with diesel fumes. He was concerned about the plantings dying because of the salt. He said he had trouble exiting Parkhaven Row since the traffic light was removed and felt the problem would only be exacerbated. He wanted to know the hours of operation, how would they handle the little hill in the rear, and about lighting.

Kyle Krewson, 1550 St. Charles Avenue, spoke in support.

Renee Giannoulis, 1446 Parkhaven Row, liked the project but not the gas station. She questioned the stability of the ground as there had been a sinkhole a few years ago at Bunts Road. The plan was trying to make the project a destination point, and that would increase traffic. Left hand turns were nearly impossible onto Detroit Avenue

from Parkhaven Avenue. She thought the idea of the plaque was strange since it was for an environmentalist. She said the Ohio EPA had not been there for analysis yet.

Holly Barnes, 1431 Parkhaven Row, liked the design but wanted to know about the two vacant homes; she did not want to see them razed. She wanted to know who was going to maintain the southwest corner.

Karen Hudson, 1512 Bunts Road, would like to see the number of pumps reduced to twelve. She was concerned about the number of high school children and wanted to see deliveries after 9:00 A.M. She asked about ADA/stroller accessibility for sidewalks and drives.

An unidentified woman, 1466 Bunts Road, spoke to represent the senior citizens as there were senior apartments across the street. She did not like the idea of a gas station, the diesel delivery trucks, gas fumes, and wanted to know the hours of operation and delivery.

Matt Herberger, 1448 Bunts Road, did not like the proposed project and quoted from the Comprehensive Plan. It did not meet the code. He did not think an eight foot fence was sufficient. He advised Mr. Avolio and the Board to look at the Marathon Station on Lake and to look at Lakewood Hospital that had an eight foot brick wall topped by a fence. He said the project did not promote public safety. He spoke in defense of Moon convenience store. He felt the project did not promote prosperity for the city and its citizens, and it would decrease property values. He was concerned about the compressed natural gas facility on the site that was not displayed currently. He did not feel the scope and size of the project was conducive to the neighborhood. The south side of the landscaping needed to be done again. He suggested the use of the type of fencing used on interstates to stop air, noise, and air pollution, vapors, and dust. He stated there were problems with benzene. He said the number of pumps needed to be reduced.

Kim McDonald, 1460 Bunts Road, had concerns about safety and real estate value. The scale of the project was too large. She wanted to know if there had been a geological study done to address the stability of the ground. There would be an increase in the volume of traffic. She wanted to know the route of the delivery trucks, and where the delivery sites were located. She felt the pumps would exceed EPA standards. She wanted to know about the emergency stops, vapor recovery, pump regulations, and lighting. She measured the fence at the hospital. It was 13 feet in height and felt it would be more appropriate than one eight feet high. The design was not in keeping with the historic streetscape. She would like to see planting boxes especially by the plaque. The size of the signage was too large.

Amy Herberger, 1448 Bunts, spoke in opposition. She did not want the pumps on Bunts Road as it was residential. The existing trees should be replaced. The project did not promote walkability. The gas tanks would permanently damage the ground and would be expensive to remediate.

Mr. Avolio addressed the questions posed by the public. Giant Eagle was in the process of purchasing the building site and the adjacent parking lot to the west. The two vacant houses would remain zoned residential and would be sold after completion of the development. The lot on Parkhaven Row would be placed on the market for redevelopment. In the interim, a fence could be erected to prevent unauthorized parking.

The proposed landscaping would be set back farther than the current. Mr. Russo said plant selection was based upon salt and urban tolerance. The width of the green space on Parkhaven Row was approximately 40 feet and on Detroit Avenue was approximately 42 feet.

Mr. Avolio stated the hours of operation would be 6:00 A.M. to midnight. Fuel delivery would avoid the peak hours; possibly at 9:00 A.M.

He received a photometric study (revised plan) that showed the poles were 22 foot high, seven building mounted wall fixtures and ten pole fixtures. He was sensitive to the neighbors. Mr. Molinski asked that the study be provided to the Board and the city.

The purpose of the emergency stops was to stop the flow of fuel from all of the pumps in the face of a safety concern/emergency; they could be operated by the attendant in the store and/or by a customer at a pump. Ohio's safety standards were for Stage II areas, and vapor was captured and suctioned into a recycling unit. Additionally, most/all cars had canister systems (vacuuming systems) to accomplish the same. OEPA had a standard form that was completed prior to construction. OEPA did not conduct an independent review of the installation. BUSTR standards required a permit that had fulfillments to be completed by and complied with in regards to underground storage tanks. All UL equipment was rated, and there were requirements that installers must be certified and State approved. Independent state inspections were required prior to gasoline being placed into the tanks. BUSTR was a division of the Ohio State Fire Marshall, the Bureau of Underground Storage Tanks, to ensure health safety and compliance of standards.

Mr. Siley addressed the ADA accessibility compliance question. Any modifications to the sidewalks, the curb ramps, and other related matters would have to meet the Americans with Disability Act guidelines. Mr. Molinski stated there were dedicated pedestrian sidewalk entrances on Detroit Avenue and Parkhaven Row with one possibly on Bunts Road. Additionally, there would be a bike rack.

Mr. Avolio said there would be no burning of garbage at the site.

Ms. Snider stated the HVAC units would be on the roof and would be screened on all sides by the parapet walls.

Mr. Avolio said the initially proposed CNG unit (compressed natural gas) had been removed from the current plans. If it were to be considered in the future, it would have to be presented for consideration to the city separately.

Addressing the deliveries issue, apart from fuel, Mr. Avolio said small trucks would deliver to the delivery entrance, and products would be wheeled by cart into the store; there would be no pallets. There would be no idling of any delivery trucks, fuel or store products, as they were required to stop their engines.

Mr. Avolio discussed the issue of landscaping maintenance. They hired contractors for snow removal and landscaping vendors who were aware of and complied with the city's requirements. The southeast corner on Bunts would have an additional row of trees in addition to more plantings on the Parkhaven Row side. He told Mr. Molinski they could clean the Parkhaven Row area and add supplemental plantings if needed on the north side of the retaining wall. The north to south dimension of the green area on the Bunts Road side was approximately 50 feet. Mr. Siley asked if it was irrigated. Mr. Avolio said it was based on the LEED silver design store standard; there was no irrigation, and they would use drought tolerant species.

In reference to the ground stability, Mr. Avolio said there was an existing geotechnical investigation that was done, and further investigation would be conducted in relationship to the underground storage units. Water and other utilities would be separate from the tanks. Mr. Siley stated the previous sinkhole on Bunts Road was because of a water main break.

As far as the question of the signage, it was not part of the evening's discussion but would have to appear before the Sign Review for approval.

Mr. Molinski said there needed to be discussion about the process. The Architectural Board of Review, Board of Building Standards, and Sign Review was there to discuss the site plan, landscape plan, and building design as presented that evening. The project would have to appear before the Board of Zoning Appeals for the setback

variance and for any variance regarding height of the fence. They will have to be heard by the Planning Commission for a Conditional Use because of the outdoor seating area. If the project was approved/granted by the three Boards/Commissions, then it would have to be reviewed by the Division of Building, Commercial, for construction drawings, reviewed by the city's civil engineers, reviewed by the Fire Marshall, and any other review as required for any installation of the storage tanks. All would have to be certified prior to any work being done on the property and/or issuance of permits.

Mr. Molinski asked about the siting of the canopy, the siting of the store, and the possible placement of the canopy towards Detroit Avenue. Mr. Avolio said the depth of the property did not allow proper placement without encroaching closer into the residential areas. Having gas pumps closer to Detroit Avenue was against the city's current code.

Mr. Molinski summarized by saying he did not like the land used of the proposed project instead preferring a mixed-use, but the current market did not support one. He noted the applicant had worked with the Board over the past couple of months at the pre-review meetings to come to an acceptable project and appreciated the work and cooperation to maintain the quality of the city. He spoke of the progress and evolution of land use and the struggle for preservation.

Mr. Fleenor asked about the southeast corner and suggested they use some type of deciduous trees, such as London Plane used at the CVS store on Clifton Boulevard. Mr. Russo agreed it would be a nice addition. Mr. Herberger did not agree it would be a good enough visual barrier. Mr. Molinski stated they would not allow a fence higher than eight feet nor would they allow a wall as a wall would enhance the feel of it being a commercial area.

Regarding the curb cut on Parkhaven Row, Mr. Avolio explained the curb cut ran north, and the grade was more flat toward the site. Being close to the residential, they proposed to move the edge of paving line north and add trees and parking; the current constrained area would be opened and relocated north with the grades flattened.

Mr. Avolio said the number of tanks was necessary due to the volume of vehicles. The current site on Manor Park Avenue was too small and caused traffic congestion with waiting vehicles. It was currently under a lease contract with a few years left, and he believed the current owner did not want the property to continue as a gas station.

A motion was made by Mr. Molinski, seconded by Mr. Fleenor to **APPROVE** with the following stipulations:

1. Submit the Photometric study showing fixtures with cutouts and no light feeding from the side onto the residential properties,
2. The addition of a row of London Plane trees to enhance the south buffer line,
3. Addition of a curb lip along the Bunts Road and Detroit Avenue frontage on the backside of the sidewalks to prevent washout from the landscaping areas,
4. Finalized plan of the rain garden design and civil engineer designs,
5. Submit samples of glass and spandrel glass, and
6. Historic marker should be mounted on a pole.

All of the members voting yea, the motion passed.

24. Adjourn.

A motion was made by Mr. Molinski, seconded by Mr. Fleenor, to **ADJOURN** the meeting at 9:55 P.M. P.M. All of the members voting yea, the motion passed.



Signature

5/10/2012

Date